

To: Burt Shephard/R10/USEPA/US@EPA;"Penoyar, Susan"
[PenoyarSJ@cdmsmith.com]; Penoyar, Susan" [PenoyarSJ@cdmsmith.com]
From: "Keefe, Jennifer"
Sent: Tue 3/27/2012 12:05:27 PM
Subject: RE: Bob Dexter's Portland Harbor BERA comments
Copy of 7-1-11 BERA Response to EPA Comments Draft Final JK 3 12 12 Dexter.xlsx
www.ridolfi.com
www.ridolfi.com

Hi Burt,

Bob sent a more formalized set of comments for our spreadsheet compilation on the Draft BERA on Friday in response to my request that was sent out to specific reviewers on specific comments. I have attached his email so you have the file and so that we can work to include these into our master file. In addition, you will see in the body of his email items that he wants to stress as comments for the latest version of the BERA.

Talk to you soon.

Sincerely,

Jenn

From: Burt Shephard [mailto:Shephard.Burt@epamail.epa.gov]
Sent: Monday, March 26, 2012 6:34 PM
To: Penoyar, Susan
Cc: Keefe, Jennifer
Subject: Bob Dexter's Portland Harbor BERA comments

Best regards,

Burt Shephard
Risk Evaluation Unit
Office of Environmental Assessment (OEA-095)
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 10
1200 6th Avenue
Seattle, WA 98101

Telephone: (206) 553-6359
Fax: (206) 553-0119

e-mail: Shephard.Burt@epa.gov

"If your experiment needs statistics to analyze the results, then you ought to have done a better experiment"

- Ernest Rutherford

----- Forwarded by Burt Shephard/R10/USEPA/US on 03/26/2012 03:33 PM -----

From: Robert Dexter <bob@ridolfi.com>

To: Burt Shephard/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, "Keefe, Jennifer (KeefeJM@cdmsmith.com)"
<KeefeJM@cdmsmith.com>,

Date: 03/01/2012 10:13 AM

Subject: 2010-07-16_BERA Comments 7,8. Final

Burt and Jenn,

Since I finally remembered, here is my redline review of the comments from Sections 7 and 8.

Bob

Robert Dexter, Ph.D.
Principal Scientist

RIDOLFI
science + engineering

1011 Western Avenue, Suite 1006, Seattle, WA 98104
tel 206.682.7294 | dir 206.436.2772 | cell 206.390.9303 | fax 206.682.5008
www.ridolfi.com

(See attached file: 2010-07-16_BERA Comments 7,8. Final.docx)

Received: from CAMEXHUB1.cdminc.internal.cdm.com (10.50.206.75) by DACEXHUB02.cdminc.internal.cdm.com (10.52.200.216) with Microsoft SMTP Server (TLS) id 14.1.355.2; Fri, 23 Mar 2012 15:16:55 -0600

Received: from camgate05.cdminc.internal.cdm.com (1.0.0.9) by CAMEXHUB1.cdminc.internal.cdm.com (10.50.206.200) with Microsoft SMTP Server id 8.3.213.0; Fri, 23 Mar 2012 17:16:54 -0400

Received: from psmtip.com ([64.18.1.203]) by camgate05.cdminc.internal.cdm.com with InterScan Message Security Suite; Fri, 23 Mar 2012 17:16:52 -0400

Received: from sthelens.ridolfi.com ([216.190.118.36]) (using TLSv1) by exprod6mx285.postini.com ([64.18.5.10]) with SMTP; Fri, 23 Mar 2012 14:16:52 PDT

Received: from sthelens.ridolfi.com ([10.0.1.22]) by STHELENS ([10.0.1.22]) with mapi; Fri, 23 Mar 2012 14:16:50 -0700

From: Robert Dexter <bob@ridolfi.com>

To: "Keefe, Jennifer" <KeefeJM@cdmsmith.com>

Subject: Copy of 7-1-11_BERA_Response to EPA Comments_Draft Final_JK_3 12 12_Dexter.xlsx

Date: Fri, 23 Mar 2012 21:20:09 +0000

Message-ID: <D8561F6D723C7545A2841BCCF5F6756B19189875E1@STHELENS>

Content-Type: multipart/mixed;

boundary="_004_D8561F6D723C7545A2841BCCF5F6756B19189875E1STHELENS_"

Content-Language: en-US

Thread-Topic: Copy of 7-1-11_BERA_Response to EPA Comments_Draft Final_JK_3 12 12_Dexter.xlsx

Thread-Index: Ac0JOmMjBVx80KkR2KPQVlpt21VnQ==
Accept-Language: en-US
X-MS-Exchange-Organization-AuthAs: Anonymous
X-MS-Exchange-Organization-AuthSource: CAMEXHUB1.cdmnc.internal.cdm.com
X-MS-Has-Attach: yes
X-MS-TNEF-Correlator:
x-pstn-addresses: from <bob@ridolfi.com> [183/9]
x-pstn-levels: (S:99.90000/99.90000 CV: 7.5413 FC:95.5390 LC:95.5390 R:95.9108 P:95.9108 M:97.0282 C:98.6951)
x-pstn-settings: 2 (0.5000:0.5000) s CV gt3 gt2 gt1 r p m c
x-pstn-neptune: 0/0/0.00/0
MIME-Version: 1.0

Jenn,

My responses. I think I got them all, but note that I mistakenly wrote over your comments on some of the later comments. Since I then saved it, I couldn't get yours back. Sorry about that.

You will also note that comments dealing with the correct TRV I deferred to Burt. In addition, I was pretty short in responding to those comments that were primarily requesting rephrasing (especially removing/changing the "no risk" language), on the basis that those sections are going to be massively rewritten anyway.

I also would like to reiterate that the technical issues of incorrect home range and the incorrect conversion of sediment wet to dry weight need to be addressed. I also want to make sure that the home range of lamprey ammocoetes is corrected. At the moment the BERA list the ammocoetes as large-home-range fish. Since they live more as

worms in the sediments, they do not really range at all.

I also want to say that you did a great job reviewing and organizing the comments.

Let me know what I missed and my responses that make less sense than the originals, and any other questions.

Bob

Robert Dexter, Ph.D.

Principal Scientist

RIDOLFI

science + engineering

1011 Western Avenue, Suite 1006, Seattle, WA 98104

tel 206.682.7294 | dir 206.436.2772 | cell 206.390.9303 | fax 206.682.5008

www.ridolfi.com